

**COMMENTS OF THE ATTORNEYS GENERAL OF MASSACHUSETTS,
COLORADO, DELAWARE, ILLINOIS, MAINE, MARYLAND, MICHIGAN,
NEW JERSEY, NEW YORK, OREGON, RHODE ISLAND, AND THE
DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA; THE CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD;
AND THE RAMSEY COUNTY, MINNESOTA, ATTORNEY**

December 1, 2022

The Honorable Lily Batchelder
Assistant Secretary (Tax Policy)
Department of the Treasury
1500 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW
Washington, DC 20220

Thomas West, Jr.
Deputy Assistant Secretary (Tax Policy)
Department of the Treasury
1500 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW
Washington, DC 20220

The Honorable Charles P. Rettig
Commissioner
Internal Revenue Service
111 Constitution Avenue, NW
Washington, DC 20224

William Paul
Principal Deputy Chief Counsel
Internal Revenue Service
1111 Constitution Avenue, NW
Washington, DC 20224

Via Electronic Submission

Re: Requests for Comments on Implementation Guidance for the Inflation Reduction Act (IRS Notices No. 2022-46 through 2022-51 & 2022-56 through 2022-58)

The Attorneys General of Massachusetts, Colorado, Delaware, Illinois, Maine, Maryland, Michigan, New Jersey, New York, Oregon, Rhode Island, the District of Columbia, and the California Air Resources Board (CARB), and the Ramsey County, Minnesota, Attorney (State and Local Governments) submit these comments in response to the Department of the Treasury (Treasury) and the Internal Revenue Service's (the IRS) nine notices (Notices) requesting comment on guidance for implementation of the Inflation Reduction Act (IRA).¹ The IRA

¹ The States and Local Governments file these Comments on the following Notices: 2022-46 (Request for Comments on Credits for Clean Vehicles); 2022-47 (Request for Comments on Energy Security Tax Credits for Manufacturing Under Sections 48C and 45X); 2022-48 (Request for Comments on Incentive Provisions for Improving the Energy Efficiency of Residential and Commercial Buildings); IRS 2022-49 (Request for Comments on Certain Energy Generation Incentives); IRS 2022-50 (Request for Comments on Elective Payment of Applicable Credits and Transfer of Certain Credits); IRS 2022-51 (Request for Comments on Prevailing Wage, Apprenticeship, Domestic Content, and Energy Communities Requirements Under the Act Commonly Known as the Inflation Reduction Act of 2022); 2022-56 (Request for Comments on Section 45W Credit for Qualified Commercial Clean Vehicles and Section 30C Alternative Fuel

presents an historic opportunity to curb climate-damaging greenhouse gas emissions, create good, green jobs, and incentivize an equitable transition to the clean energy economy needed to avoid the worst effects of the climate crisis. To fulfill its promise, however, the IRA must be implemented carefully and quickly, informed by extensive stakeholder input and existing state programs, and in a manner designed to ensure equitable distribution of benefits.

We commend Treasury and the IRS for promptly seeking public input to ensure effective and equitable implementation of the IRA. We also appreciate the flexibility to submit comments on these important and complex issues beyond the initial thirty-day comment window on some of the Notices. In response to the Notices, we offer the following general and specific comments to guide implementation of the IRA's tax provisions. First, we describe the State and Local Governments' interest in prompt, effective, and equitable implementation of the IRA to reduce greenhouse gas emissions and transition to a clean energy economy. Second, we emphasize the importance of centering equity and environmental justice in IRA implementation. Finally, we offer specific suggestions regarding IRS Notices 2022-58, 2022-57, 2022-56, 2022-51, 2022-49, 2022-48, 2022-47, and 2022-46.

I. Our State and Local Governments Have Significant Interests in Prompt, Effective, and Equitable Implementation of the IRA.

Climate change is already causing significant harms and costs for our State and Local Governments and our residents. The past eight years are on track to be the eight warmest years on record,² with 2020 tied for the lead.³ Wildfires, heat waves, increases in the frequency and severity of extreme weather events, sea-level rise, changes in agriculture and food production, precipitation changes, and other climate-change harms threaten our residents' physical and mental health and our economies and natural resources.⁴ For example, this year Massachusetts has experienced significant or critical drought conditions across the entire state,⁵ leading to drought-induced fires, water restrictions, and water quality and availability impacts on private wells and water-dependent habitats across the state.⁶ California has experienced eight of the ten warmest years on record between

Vehicle Refueling Property Credit); 2022-57 (Request for Comments on the Credit for Carbon Oxide Sequestration); 2022-58 (Request for Comments on Credits for Clean Hydrogen and Clean Fuel Production).

² See World Meteorological Org., Provisional State of the Global Climate in 2022, <http://bit.ly/3GusNsm>.

³ Press Release, Nat'l Aeronautics & Space Admin., 2020 Tied for Warmest Year on Record, NASA Analysis Shows (Jan. 14, 2021), <http://bit.ly/3EhvfzQ>.

⁴ See, e.g., U.S. Glob. Change Rsch. Prog., *Climate Science Special Report: Fourth National Climate Assessment, Volume I*, at 10 (D.J. Wuebbles et al. eds., 2017), <http://bit.ly/3hLN1U9>.

⁵ Massachusetts Drought Status (Sept. 8, 2022), <http://bit.ly/3hKCnWR> (last visited Nov. 28, 2022).

⁶ Press Release, Mass. Exec. Off. of Energy & Env't Aff., Massachusetts Continues to Experience Drought Conditions (July 21, 2022), <http://bit.ly/3Vi0RfS>.

2012 and 2022, with accompanying increases in heat-related illnesses, drought, pest infestations, and wildfires.⁷ New York State has also experienced dramatic increases in the frequency and intensity of extreme rainstorms, consistent with scientists' predictions of the alteration of historical weather patterns resulting from climate change.⁸ For example, last year, the remnants of Hurricane Ida dumped nearly a half of a foot of rain in the New York City area in a few hours, resulting in flash flooding that killed more than forty people in the region, including drowning several Queens residents in their basement apartments.⁹ In 2012, Superstorm Sandy slammed into the New Jersey coast, causing thirty-eight deaths, widespread inundation, and almost \$30 billion in damage.¹⁰ In the District of Columbia, more intense, heavy rains and rising sea levels have led to frequent flooding events and the area has suffered from record-breaking heat waves.¹¹ And the dire consequences of climate change will continue to disproportionately impact disadvantaged communities—including Black and Latinx populations and communities of low wealth, as well as Native American tribal communities—which already bear a disproportionate burden of public health and environmental hazards.¹²

Our states have established ambitious greenhouse gas reduction targets to tackle the climate crisis.¹³ And we have spent significant resources and developed substantial expertise in implementing mitigation measures to meet those targets

⁷ Cal. Env't Prot. Agency, Off. of Env't Health Hazard Assessment, *Indicators of Climate Change in California* i-6 to i-7, i-14 to i-15 (C. Milanes et al., 4th ed. Nov. 2022), <http://bit.ly/3VusCBI>.

⁸ See N.Y. State Off. of the Att'y Gen., *Current & Future Trends in Extreme Rainfall Across New York State*, A Report from the Environmental Protection Bureau of New York State Attorney General Eric T. Schneiderman (Sept. 2014), <http://bit.ly/3EQUo4t> (based on data from the 2014 National Climate Assessment and the National Oceanographic and Atmospheric Administration's Northeast Regional Climate Center).

⁹ See Jesse McKinley et al., "Flooding from Ida Kills Dozens of People in Four States," *New York Times* (Sept. 2, 2021, updated Oct. 13, 2021), <http://bit.ly/3XKBK6Z>.

¹⁰ Stephanie Hoopes Halpin, Rutgers Sch. of Pub. Aff. & Admin., *The Impact of Superstorm Sandy on New Jersey Towns and Households* (Oct. 25, 2013), <https://rucore.libraries.rutgers.edu/rutgers-lib/44886/PDF/1/play/>.

¹¹ World Health Organization, *Health and Climate Change Urban Profile: Washington, District of Columbia* (May 4, 2022), <http://bit.ly/3uf4ZBE>.

¹² See EPA, *Climate Change and Social Vulnerability in the United States 6-7* (Sept. 2021), <http://bit.ly/3GUqbEs>; IPCC, 2022: Summary for Policymakers, in *Climate Change 2022: Impacts, Adaptation and Vulnerability* 9, 12 (2022), <http://bit.ly/3EEzBCy>.

¹³ See, e.g., Mass. Gen. Laws ch. 21N, § 3(b) (establishing statewide greenhouse gas emissions limits, including net-zero emissions in 2050); Mass. Exec. Off. of Energy & Env't Aff., *Determination of Statewide Greenhouse Gas Emissions Limits and Sector-Specific Sublimits for 2025 and 2030 1* (June 30, 2022), <http://bit.ly/3ggrZg9> (establishing statewide greenhouse gas emissions limits of 33 percent below 1990 levels for 2025 and 50% below 1990 levels for 2030, with sector-specific sublimits, including for residential heating and cooling, transportation, and electric power); N.Y. Gen. Laws 2019, ch. 106 (establishing statewide greenhouse gas emissions limits of 40 percent below 1990 levels by 2030 and 85 percent below 1990 levels by 2050); 2022 Md. Laws Ch. 38 (requiring a 60 percent reduction in statewide greenhouse gas emissions from 2006 levels by 2030 and statewide net-zero statewide greenhouse gas emissions by 2045).

and improve the resilience of our communities—including significant incentives relating to energy efficiency, clean energy, and electric vehicles. For example:

- Massachusetts spent over \$2.8 billion on energy efficiency programs from 2019 to 2021, including through the Mass Save Energy Efficiency (Mass Save) program,¹⁴ and awarded \$13 million for installation of electric vehicle charging stations in 2022.¹⁵ Reflecting the importance of continued energy efficiency investment, the 2022-2024 Mass Save Energy program will invest \$3.94 billion to deliver an estimated \$9 billion in benefits to Massachusetts residents and reductions of 845,000 metric tons of CO₂e by 2030, with significantly increased incentives for electric heat pumps for residential, income-eligible, and commercial and industrial customers.¹⁶
- California has appropriated over \$21 billion, funded by the auction of emission allowances under its cap-and-trade program, to climate programs across the state, including incentives for low-carbon transportation, green jobs training, and renewable energy.¹⁷
- New York’s Climate Leadership and Community Protection Act requires the state to procure at least 6,000 megawatts of distributed solar generation by 2025, 3,000 megawatts of energy storage by 2030, and 9,000 megawatts of offshore wind by 2035.¹⁸
- In the District of Columbia, the Department of Energy and Environment has spent over \$500 million since 2017 on executing an equitable and affordable clean energy transition, including by supporting energy efficiency, clean transportation, and renewable energy and energy democracy programs serving residential, commercial, institutional, and government sectors in the District.¹⁹ Over the past 5 years, the DC Sustainable Energy Utility

¹⁴ See Ariela Lovett, Mass. Mun. Ass’n, “State approves new three-year energy efficiency plan” (Feb. 27, 2019), <http://bit.ly/3XHtPYd>; Mass. Dep’t of Pub. Util. (DPU) Order, D.P.U. 18-110 through D.P.U. 18-119 (Jan. 29, 2019), <http://bit.ly/3VI2jyc>; 2019-2021 Three-Year Energy Efficiency Term Reports, D.P.U. 22-110 through D.P.U. 22-119, <http://bit.ly/3EIBpum> (detailing Mass Save program budgets, savings, benefits, and greenhouse gas reductions).

¹⁵ Press Release, Mass. Dep’t of Env’t Prot. (DEP), Baker-Polito Administration Awards Over \$13 Million for Electric Vehicle Fast-Charging Stations at 150 Locations Across the Commonwealth (Feb. 3, 2022), <http://bit.ly/3gQHfag>.

¹⁶ Press Release, Mass. DPU, DPU Approves Massachusetts’ Nation-Leading Three Year Energy Efficiency Plan (Feb. 2, 2022), <http://bit.ly/3tFS4Iy>; *see also* Mass. DPU Order, D.P.U. 21-120 through D.P.U. 21-129 (Jan. 31, 2022), <https://fileservice.eea.comacloud.net/FileService.Api/file/FileRoom/14461268>.

¹⁷ Cal. Air Res. Bd. (CARB), California Climate Investments Funded Programs (Sept. 2022), <http://bit.ly/3ufHA2V>.

¹⁸ N.Y. Env. Cons. L. § 75-0103[13][e].

¹⁹ D.C. Off. of the Chief Fin. Off., FY2023 Approved Budget and Financial Plan, Vol. 4, Agency Budget Chs. Pt. III at F-15 (Aug. 1, 2022), <https://cfo.dc.gov/node/289642>; D.C. Off. of the Chief Fin. Off., FY2022 Approved Budget and Financial Plan, Vol. 4, Agency Budget Chs. Pt. III at F-23, (Sept. 17, 2021); D.C. Off. of the Chief Fin. Off., FY2021 Approved Budget and Financial Plan, Vol. 4, Agency Budget Chs. Pt. III at F-23 (Aug. 27, 2020); D.C. Off. of the Chief Fin. Off., FY2020 Approved Budget and Financial Plan, Vol. 4, Agency Budget Chs. Pt. III at F-47 (July 25, 2019).

(DCSEU)—which delivers financial incentives, technical assistance, and education in energy efficiency and renewable energy to District residents—has spent over \$100 million, which resulted in more than an estimated \$856 million in lifetime energy cost savings, prevented about 4.6 million metric tons of projected lifetime CO₂e emissions, and created over 420 new full-time green jobs.²⁰ In addition, the District’s Capital Improvements Plan for 2022-28 includes nearly \$8 million to retrofit District government buildings to improve energy efficiency and install new electric charging stations that will support electrification of the District’s vehicle fleet.²¹

And we have spent significant resources on adaptation measures needed to respond to the already occurring and unavoidable consequences of climate change. For example, since 2017, Massachusetts has invested \$100 million in 341 municipalities on resilience measures,²² including \$32.8 million in grants this year.²³ California appropriated \$81 million for resilience planning and wetlands restoration and over \$500 million on wildfire prevention and readiness.²⁴ New Jersey has spent a total of \$1.2 billion rebuilding its barrier island beach and dune system to protect its coastal communities from rising seas and extreme weather.²⁵ Our experiences both highlight the need for immediate, substantial investment in emissions reduction measures nationwide and provide insight into effective, equitable approaches to implementing energy efficiency, clean energy, and electric vehicle incentives, as further described below.

Our State and Local Governments also have a substantial interest in ensuring that workers’ rights are protected and that employers claiming federal benefits operate on a level playing field—interests squarely implicated by the IRA’s credit enhancements for compliance with its prevailing wage and apprenticeship provisions. Violations of wage and hour laws continue to harm our workforces and demand significant enforcement resources. The Massachusetts Attorney General’s Office, for example, has received over 800 complaints related to the Commonwealth’s Prevailing Wage Laws since 2015.²⁶ In the same time period, the Office has issued over 451 prevailing wage civil citations totaling over \$11 million

²⁰ DC Sustainable Energy Util., *A Decade of Transformation: 2021 Annual Report* (2021).

²¹ D.C. Off. of the Chief Fin. Off., *FY2023 Approved Budget and Financial Plan*, Vol. 5, *Capital Improvements Plan* at 5-15 (Aug. 1, 2022), <https://cfo.dc.gov/node/289642>.

²² Mass. Exec. Order No. 569: *Establishing an Integrated Climate Change Strategy for the Commonwealth* (Sept. 16, 2016), <http://bit.ly/3UKqaH7>.

²³ Press Release, Exec. Off. of Energy & Env’t Aff., *Baker-Polito Administration Awards Over \$32 Million in Climate Change Funding to Cities and Towns Bringing Total Investment to \$100 Million* (Aug. 30, 2022), <http://bit.ly/3GIIT7H>.

²⁴ CARB, *California Climate Investments Funded Programs*, *supra* n.17.

²⁵ Nicholas Angarone et al., *State of New Jersey Climate Change Resilience Strategy 95-96* (Oct. 12, 2021), <https://www.nj.gov/dep/climatechange/docs/nj-climate-resilience-strategy-2021.pdf>.

²⁶ *See* Off. of Mass. Att’y Gen., *AG’s Fair Labor Division Enforcement* (Nov. 14, 2022), <https://tinyurl.com/5b7fmfn3> (tracking the Massachusetts Attorney General’s Fair Labor Division’s enforcement citations).

and conducted dozens of trainings on the subject for municipalities, procurement officers, unions, and other interested members of the public.²⁷ While our State and Local Governments' enforcement of our own prevailing wage and apprenticeship laws runs parallel to, and is distinct from, enforcement of the federal laws incorporated in the IRA's tax credit provisions, the interest in ensuring that workers are paid adequate wages and that publicly subsidized projects contribute to the continued availability of skilled labor is similar under state and federal law.

II. Treasury and the IRS Should Center Equity and Justice as Guiding Principles in All IRA-Related Guidance.

We commend Treasury and the IRS's commitment to three guiding principles—robust public engagement, clarity and certainty, and sound stewardship²⁸—and urge Treasury and the IRS to further commit to centering equity and environmental justice in all aspects of IRA implementation. Indeed, multiple executive orders require Treasury and the IRS to consider equity and environmental justice in implementing the IRA's climate- and labor-related provisions. *See* Exec. Order 13,985, 86 Fed. Reg. 7009 (Jan. 25, 2021) (directing all federal agencies to “work to redress inequities in their policies and programs that serve as barriers to equal opportunity”); Exec. Order 14,008, 86 Fed. Reg. 7619 (Jan. 27, 2021) (directing federal agencies to “secure environmental justice and spur economic opportunity for disadvantaged communities that have been historically marginalized and overburdened by pollution and underinvestment”).²⁹ To fulfill those mandates and to secure the IRA's intended benefits for disadvantaged and low wealth communities, we recommend that Treasury and the IRS prioritize: (1) robust community engagement and affirmative, iterative outreach; (2) clarity and accessibility in IRA-related guidance, regulations, and public communications; (3) implementation targeted toward increasing eligibility and reducing tax burdens

²⁷ *See* Off. of Mass. Att’y Gen. Maura Healey, Protecting Massachusetts Workers: Attorney General Maura Healey's 2022 Labor Day Report 6-13 (2022), <http://bit.ly/3Gtjp8f>. In addition to the staff and resources at the Massachusetts Attorney General's Office dedicated to prevailing wage enforcement, the Massachusetts Department of Labor Standards and the Division of Apprentice Standards devote extensive resources to administering the state's prevailing wage and apprenticeship programs, including by issuing prevailing wage rate schedules, determining proper classification, and monitoring apprenticeship programs throughout the state.

²⁸ U.S. Treasury Dep't, Fact Sheet: Treasury, IRS Open Public Comment on Implementing the Inflation Reduction Act's Clean Energy Tax Incentives, <http://bit.ly/3V94aW6>.

²⁹ *See* Exec. Order 13,990, 86 Fed. Reg. 7037 (Jan. 25, 2021) (directing all executive departments and agencies to address any actions that conflict with goals of reducing greenhouse gas emissions and prioritizing environmental justice, among other national objectives); Exec. Order 13,563, 76 Fed. Reg. 3821 (Jan. 21, 2011) (directing agencies to select regulatory approaches that maximize net benefits including “distributive impacts[] and equity”); Exec. Order 12,898, 59 Fed. Reg. 7629 (Feb. 16, 1994) (directing each federal agency to “make achieving environmental justice part of its mission by identifying and addressing, as appropriate, disproportionately high and adverse human health or environmental effects of its programs, policies, and activities on minority populations and low-income populations”); Exec. Order 12,866, 51 Fed. Reg. 51,735 (Oct. 4, 1993) (ordering agencies to consider “distributive impacts[] and equity” in designing regulations).

for disadvantaged and low wealth communities; and (4) robust monitoring and enforcement to ensure equitable distribution of benefits.

First, Treasury should engage in robust, iterative public outreach and community engagement in developing and preparing all guidance, rules, and public-facing materials related to the IRA. Where such extensive outreach cannot be completed without delaying implementation, Treasury and the IRS should promptly issue transitional guidance with a timeline for additional outreach and publication of additional guidance informed by such outreach. In particular, we urge Treasury and the IRS to consider:

- significantly increasing resources devoted to stakeholder outreach, particularly regarding provisions intended to benefit disadvantaged communities and communities of low wealth;
- providing multiple ways to participate in stakeholder sessions, including through phone and remote access;
- providing opportunities to participate in stakeholder sessions outside the hours of 9:00AM and 5:00PM;
- publicizing opportunities for input through regular updates on websites, mailing lists, press releases, and social media posts;
- providing all materials in multiple languages and providing translation for stakeholder sessions, as further described below;
- consulting with other federal agencies—including the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA)—to explore established channels for community engagement;
- conducting affirmative, on-the-ground outreach in communities that have historically been under-represented in government decision making to identify additional barriers to effective participation in Treasury and IRS proceedings;
- establishing a dedicated stakeholder working group to develop recommendations to improve access to IRA benefits by disadvantaged communities and communities of low wealth;³⁰ and
- providing resources to states to conduct simultaneous public outreach and community engagement clarifying how state and federal rebates and tax credits will work together.

In addition, Treasury and the IRS should commit to continued engagement with affected taxpayers and other stakeholders even after issuance of guidance and regulations to ensure IRA implementation evolves alongside changing

³⁰ The Massachusetts Energy Efficiency Advisory Council Equity Working Group could serve as a useful model. See Mass. Energy Efficiency Advisory Council Equity Working Group (May 20, 2020), <http://bit.ly/3XghtWD> (describing sub-committee dedicated to working with stakeholders to develop programmatic and implementation recommendations to improve access by hard-to-reach and underserved populations).

circumstances and need communicated by affected communities. Meaningful stakeholder engagement will not only help ensure the IRA is implemented effectively, drawing on the experiences of states and other regulators with similar programs and the lived experience and expertise of affected communities.³¹ It also will enhance public awareness of the IRA’s many benefits and increase public confidence in Treasury and the IRS’s implementation of the IRA.³²

Second, and relatedly, Treasury and the IRS should ensure that all regulations, guidance, and public communications regarding tax credits and other benefits available under the IRA are easily understandable and accessible so that all affected communities understand how to receive benefits. While some taxpayers can hire professional accountants to complete their tax returns, many cannot. We appreciate IRS’s prompt efforts to hire thousands more customer service representatives to assist taxpayers by phone and in person during the 2023 tax season.³³ And we further emphasize that all guidance and IRA-related communications must be straightforward, including, where appropriate, step-by-step instructions in plain language and concise Question and Answer documents.³⁴ Additional measures Treasury and the IRS should consider include establishing a dedicated IRA hotline for low-income taxpayer households, providing funding for low-income taxpayer clinics, offering technical assistance for nonprofits and state and local governments, and providing alternative communication forms to increase understanding and accessibility, like webinars, video tutorials, and easy-to-use online tools to calculate benefits available for particular technologies. Finally, and

³¹ See Cary Coglianese et al., *Transparency and Public Participation in the Federal Rulemaking Process: Recommendations for the New Administration*, 77 Geo. Wash. L. Rev. 924, 946-47 (2009) (“Robust public participation in the rulemaking process allows agencies to obtain information that helps them (1) improve the quality of new regulations, (2) increase the probability of compliance, and (3) create a more complete record for judicial review. Public participation is also fundamentally linked to concepts of legitimacy and fairness in agency rulemaking.”); Cynthia R. Farina et al., *Knowledge in the People: Rethinking “Value” in Public Rulemaking Participation*, 47 Wake Forest L. Rev. 1185, 1197 (2012) (positing that broader participation in rulemaking by “individuals and small private or public entities who would be directly affected but who, based on historical participation patterns, are unlikely to engage in the conventional comment process” can contribute valuable information such as “information about impacts, ambiguities and gaps, enforceability, contributory causes, unintended consequences, etc. that is known by participants because of their lived experience in the complex reality into which the proposed regulation would be introduced.”).

³² See Marc B. Mihaly, *Citizen Participation in the Making of Environmental Decisions: Evolving Obstacles and Potential Solutions Through Partnership with Experts and Agents*, 27 Pace Env’t L. Rev. 151, 164-65 (Sept. 2009) (detailing myriad benefits of public participation).

³³ See News Release, IRS, IRS announces job openings to hire over 700 new employees across the country to help taxpayers in person (Nov. 9, 2022), <http://bit.ly/3OeDrFw>; News Release, IRS, IRS quickly moves forward with taxpayer service improvements; 4,000 hired to provide more help to people during 2023 tax season on phones (Oct. 27, 2022), <http://bit.ly/3Oe1CUH>.

³⁴ For example, the Mass Save website is consumer-friendly, easily navigated, and provides easy-to-understand, multi-lingual information on available energy efficiency incentives, as well as ways to participate in the energy efficiency programs. See Mass Save, <https://www.masssave.com/> (last visited Nov. 29, 2022).

critically, we also urge Treasury and the IRS to provide community-focused and responsive language access, including translating public documents into multiple languages, providing interpretation and translation services for all stakeholder sessions, and establishing a transparent procedure for receiving and promptly responding to community requests for improved language access.

Third, Treasury and the IRS should implement the IRA with the goal of increasing eligibility and reducing tax burdens for disadvantaged and low-wealth communities. For example, where the IRA requires income verification, Treasury and the IRS should accept participation in existing federal income-eligible support programs so that verification does not itself pose a barrier to delivery of incentives.³⁵ Treasury and the IRS also should craft guidance to ensure that participants in these support programs are not penalized for receiving the benefits Congress intended for them. Particularly in the case of low-income participants, IRA incentives should fall under the General Welfare Exception and not be counted as taxable income. Similarly, we urge Treasury and the IRS to clarify that participation in analogous state programs that facilitate the adoption of clean vehicles (such as California’s “Clean Cars 4 All” scrap-and-replace program), weatherized and energy efficient homes, and other climate-related general welfare benefits will not increase participants’ tax burden.³⁶

Fourth, we urge Treasury and the IRS to verify and work to ensure that the benefits of IRA incentives are actually delivered to communities as intended by the statute. Treasury and the IRS should establish procedures to monitor the distribution and environmental and economic impacts of IRA climate and clean energy incentives—including increased credits for projects in “energy communities” in §§ 45(b)(11), 48(a)(14), 45Y(g)(7), and 48E(a)(3)(A) and low-income communities in § 48(e) and 48E(h)—to verify that IRA benefits are widely and equitably distributed to disadvantaged and low wealth communities. Finally, it is critical that Treasury and the IRS prioritize and devote significant resources to enforcement of IRA provisions. And, as further discussed *infra*, Section III.d.i., Treasury and the IRS should enhance enforcement and foster accountability by requiring entities claiming credits under the IRA to disclose the credit claimed, allowing interested parties—including states, affected communities, and workers—to verify claims of compliance with IRA conditions designed to ensure equitable distribution of climate and labor benefits.

³⁵ In Massachusetts, for example, customers can establish eligibility for utility low-income discount rates “upon verification of a low-income customer’s receipt of any means tested public benefit . . . for which eligibility does not exceed 200 per cent of the federal poverty level based on a household’s gross income.” Mass. Gen. Laws ch. 164, § 1F(4)(i).

³⁶ CARB, Clean Cars 4 All: About, <http://bit.ly/3GY4lQz> (last visited Nov. 29, 2022).

III. Specific Comments on IRS Notices 2022-58, 2022-57, 2022-56, 2022-51, 2022-49, 2022-48, 2022-47, and 2022-46.

a. Comments on Clean Hydrogen Credit Provisions, IRS Notice 2022-58

When used as a fuel, hydrogen produces no end-point carbon emissions. But the overall carbon intensity of hydrogen depends largely on how it is produced in the first place. For example, the carbon intensity of hydrogen produced through the electrolysis of water, colloquially known as “green” hydrogen, depends on the carbon intensity of the electricity used to run the electrolyzer, which, in turn, depends on the resource mix used to supply the electric grid where the hydrogen is generated at the time it is produced. Accordingly, Treasury should work with EPA and the U.S. Department of Energy (DOE) to establish resources and guidance for calculating and verifying the carbon intensity of the source electricity used to produce “green” hydrogen.

Treasury and the IRS also should work with EPA and DOE to adopt rigorous carbon accounting principles on an expedited basis to determine lifecycle greenhouse gas emissions rates from other hydrogen production processes. For example, hydrogen produced from the reformation of natural gas or coal-derived syngas, colloquially known as “blue” or “gray” hydrogen, has the potential to result in more greenhouse gas emissions than coal if all lifecycle emissions, including fugitive methane emissions, are accounted for.³⁷ Accordingly, hydrogen produced through these processes should not qualify for the 45V credit simply because Carbon Capture and Sequestration (CCS) is used to limit emissions at the point of production. And Treasury should establish a transparent process for reviewing and responding to petitions to determine lifecycle greenhouse gas emissions rates where none has been determined, including comprehensive documentation, monitoring, and auditing requirements and procedures for consultation with EPA and DOE on each such petition.

California, Oregon, and Washington have developed low-carbon fuel standard (LCFS) regulations, which are designed to drive down the lifecycle greenhouse gas emissions, or carbon intensity, of transportation fuels sold, supplied, or offered for sale in each state over time. These state regulations confront many of the issues on which Treasury and the IRS have requested comment concerning hydrogen’s lifecycle emissions. Under California’s LCFS, for example, fuel providers must report carbon intensity scores reflecting the greenhouse gas emissions directly associated with the production, transportation, and use of a given fuel, as well as

³⁷ See R. Howarth & M. Jacobson, *How green is blue hydrogen?*, 9 Energy Sc. & Eng’g 1676, 1683 (July 16, 2021), <http://bit.ly/3UPNB22>.

significant indirect effects on greenhouse gas emissions, such as changes in land use. To determine the carbon intensity of a particular incentivized low-carbon-intensity fuel, suppliers may either use average carbon intensity scores calculated by CARB and provided on a regularly updated “Lookup Table”³⁸ or calculate an individual score based on the lifecycle emissions of a fuel’s specific production process.³⁹

Hydrogen is one such incentivized low-carbon-intensity fuel. A supplier of hydrogen produced in California from steam-methane reforming may rely on an assigned average carbon intensity score provided in the Lookup Table, varying by the feedstock and source of energy used in production. A hydrogen supplier may use one of these default carbon intensity scores upon approval based on a few simple pieces of documentation. Alternatively, the supplier may obtain an individual score based on the modeled lifecycle emissions associated with producing and transporting their hydrogen, using the GREET model specified in the regulation, with more thorough documentation and verification requirements.⁴⁰ The LCFS regulations include requirements for recordkeeping and auditing,⁴¹ including ongoing monitoring, as well as requirements for periodic third-party verification,⁴² with accreditation requirements for third-party verification services⁴³ and conflict-of-interest provisions to ensure independence and integrity of third-party verification services.⁴⁴ We urge Treasury and the IRS to consider similar methods, procedures, and safeguards to accurately assess, and regularly update assessments of, lifecycle greenhouse gas emissions in implementing § 45V.

b. Comments on Carbon Oxide Sequestration Credit Provisions, IRS Notice 2022-57

California’s LCFS regulation also allows CCS projects to generate credits that fuel providers can use to meet their compliance obligations. To ensure the environmental integrity of such credits, CARB created a CCS Protocol to ensure the emissions associated with such credits are real, accurately quantified, verified, and

³⁸ See Cal. Code Reg., tit. 17, § 95488.5, subd. (e), Table 7-1 (default carbon intensity scores for hydrogen (i.e., the Lookup Table)); *id.*, subd. (b) (requirements for applications for new fuel types to be included in the Lookup Table); CARB, CA-GREET3.0 Lookup Table Pathways, Technical Support Documentation, 35-44 (Aug. 13, 2018), <http://bit.ly/3VIE9N> (summarizing the factors that lead to varying carbon intensities for different sources and forms of hydrogen fuel).

³⁹ See Cal. Code Reg., tit. 17, § 95488.1.

⁴⁰ See *id.* § 95488.7, subd. (a) (documentation requirements for sources and forms of hydrogen fuel not found in the Lookup Table).

⁴¹ See *id.* § 95491.1.

⁴² See *id.* § 95500.

⁴³ See *id.* § 95501.

⁴⁴ See *id.* § 95503.

permanently sequestered.⁴⁵ The CCS Protocol contains detailed provisions for recordkeeping and reporting, third-party verification, and sequestration integrity that Treasury and the IRS may find relevant to the specific requests for comment in Notice 2022-57. Although Treasury and the IRS seek comment on verifying the *capture* amounts in § 45Q(d)(2) specifically, we urge Treasury and the IRS to also ensure sound implementation of the “secure geological storage” requirement in § 45Q(f)(2) to preserve Congress’s fundamental environmental objectives in designing the § 45Q credit.

c. Comments on Qualified Commercial Clean Vehicles and Section 30C Alternative Fuel Vehicle Refueling Property Credits Provisions, IRS Notice 2022-56

Since 1990, California and other states have encouraged the adoption of zero-emission vehicles (ZEVs) that offer clean alternatives to the internal combustion engine, including battery electric vehicles.⁴⁶ The ZEV regulation defines a battery electric vehicle as “any vehicle that operates solely by use of a battery or battery pack, or that is powered primarily through the use of an electric battery or battery pack but uses a flywheel or capacitor that stores energy produced by the electric motor or through regenerative braking to assist in vehicle operation.”⁴⁷ The ZEV regulation further defines an “electric drive system” as “an electric motor and associated power electronics which provide acceleration torque to the drive wheels sometime during normal vehicle operation,” but not including” components that could act as a motor, but are configured to act only as a generator or engine starter in a particular vehicle application.”⁴⁸ Previous versions of the ZEV regulation have provided partial credit for hybrid electric vehicles based on the extent of the electric drive’s power and other characteristics.⁴⁹

These definitions may help the IRS provide guidance on what it means for a motor vehicle to be “propelled to a significant extent by an electric motor which draws electricity from a battery” for purposes of the Sections 30D(d)(1)(F) and

⁴⁵ See *id.* § 95490; CARB, Carbon Capture and Sequestration Protocol under the Low Carbon Fuel Standard (Aug. 2018), <http://bit.ly/3UoViuS>.

⁴⁶ California enforces its ZEV regulation pursuant to a preemption waiver granted by the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency under Clean Air Act § 209(b), see 42 U.S.C. § 7543(b), which allows other states to adopt the same ZEV regulation under Clean Air Act § 177, see *id.* § 7507.

⁴⁷ Cal. Code Regs., tit. 13, § 1962, subd. (i)(2); *id.* § 1962.1, subd. (i)(3); see also CARB, California Exhaust Emission Standards and Test Procedures for 2018 and Subsequent Model Zero-Emission and Hybrid Electric Vehicles, in the Passenger Car, Light-Duty Truck and Medium-Duty Vehicle Classes, at B-2 (as amended Sept. 3, 2015), <https://tinyurl.com/ynawf9jn>.

⁴⁸ Cal. Code Regs., tit. 13, § 1962, subd. (i)(3); *id.* § 1962.1, subd. (i)(7); see also California Exhaust Emission Standards and Test Procedures, *supra* n.47, at B-3.

⁴⁹ Cal. Code Regs., tit. 13, § 1962, subd. (c)(4)(B)(1) (table); *id.* § 1962.1, subd. (c)(4)(B)(1) (table). The hybrid electric vehicles classification tables are not featured in the current ZEV regulation and are offered here solely to illustrate the different gradations of an electric drive system’s contribution to vehicle operation.

45W(c)(3)(A) credits.⁵⁰ In particular, “propelled to a significant extent” should be defined to accommodate popular ZEV features like regenerative braking that promote the vehicle’s efficient operation. We also request that the definition of “mobile machinery” in Internal Revenue Code § 4053(8) be interpreted broadly to include a wide variety of off-road equipment types and powertrains, which may be mobile self-propelled or portable (towed), or perform work when stationary. We urge the IRS to allow tax credits for zero-emission off-road equipment such as zero-emission construction, agricultural, and industrial equipment (e.g., battery powered forklifts, lawn and garden equipment, skid steer loaders).

d. Comments on Prevailing Wage, Apprenticeship, and Energy Community Enhancement Provisions, IRS Notice 2022-51

i. Prevailing Wage and Apprenticeship Recommendations

We appreciate Treasury and the IRS’s prompt publication of initial guidance regarding the IRA’s prevailing wage and apprenticeship provisions (Initial Guidance), starting the 60-day clock for these important requirements to take effect.⁵¹ We also appreciate Treasury and the IRS’s stated commitments to ensuring the IRA supports good-paying jobs in the clean energy industry, expands workforce training pathways into these jobs, and lowers costs for American families.⁵² The Initial Guidance, however, does not comprehensively address many issues that need to be resolved for Treasury and the IRS to meet those commitments in implementing the IRA’s prevailing wage and apprenticeship requirements.

As enforcers of worker protection laws, including state prevailing wage requirements, our State and Local Governments have first-hand experience with complex schemes employers use to attempt to circumvent worker protections. It is all too common for employers and contractors to submit certified payroll records that, on their face, appear to comply with prevailing wage requirements while hiding the fact that workers were paid off the books at non-prevailing rates of pay or were required to return to their employers the difference between their regular wages and the prevailing wage.⁵³ To ensure that workers receive the benefit of

⁵⁰ See IRS Notices 2022-46, 2022-56.

⁵¹ U.S. Dep’t of the Treasury, Notice 2022-61: Prevailing Wage and Apprenticeship Initial Guidance under Section 45(b)(6)(B)(ii), 87 Fed. Reg. 73,580 (Nov. 30, 2022).

⁵² Press Release, U.S. Dep’t of the Treasury, Treasury Announces Guidance on Inflation Reduction Act’s Strong Labor Protections (Nov. 29, 2022), <https://tinyurl.com/2uscy32k>.

⁵³ For example, the New York Attorney General’s Office in 2014 obtained a guilty plea from a contractor who created false business records and issued checks to workers to demonstrate compliance with the prevailing wage law while requiring workers to cash the checks at his bank and kick back, or return, most of the cash to him. See Press Release, N.Y. Off. of the Att’y Gen., A.G. Schneiderman Announces Conviction Of Construction Boss For Underpaying Workers On Project At JFK Airport (Nov. 20, 2014), <https://tinyurl.com/2kt3hz9p>.

prevailing wages and apprenticeships promised by the IRA, Treasury and the IRS should (1) publish additional guidance incorporating stakeholder feedback regarding prevailing wage and apprenticeship requirements; (2) require robust documentation from taxpayers claiming benefits; (3) bolster accountability and enforcement; and (4) design proactive policies to foster job creation.

First, while we commend Treasury and the IRS for issuing prompt Initial Guidance, we urge them to issue further guidance, in consultation with the U.S. Department of Labor (DOL), to incorporate additional stakeholder feedback regarding effective and transparent implementation. Such stakeholder-informed guidance will help ensure that those claiming enhanced credits or deductions under the prevailing wage provisions do so with the appropriate information, which will increase efficiency and decrease the need for compliance enforcement. Additionally, Treasury and the IRS should clarify that any project funded in part or in whole by the IRA must comply with the provisions of *both* the Davis-Bacon Act and the applicable state prevailing wage laws.

Second, we urge Treasury and the IRS to require robust documentation substantiating compliance with prevailing wage and apprenticeship requirements. Beyond requiring taxpayers simply *to maintain* records material to compliance, as the Initial Guidance provides, Treasury and the IRS should require all contractors and taxpayers intending to seek prevailing wage and apprenticeship enhancements *to file* with DOL a notice of intention to seek a tax credit prior to commencing work, certified payroll records covering each week of the time period for which they intend to claim enhanced benefits, and a signed statement certifying under the penalty of perjury that the information contained within the certified payroll records is accurate.⁵⁴ And all solicitations, contracts, and subcontracts that form the basis of a request for IRA tax benefits should explicitly require that certified payrolls be submitted to DOL on at least a monthly basis with wage determinations attached. Moreover, all solicitations, contracts, and subcontracts that form the basis of a request for IRA tax benefits should explicitly require compliance with Davis-Bacon and state prevailing wage requirements and should state that compliance with such requirements is a prerequisite to eligibility for any tax credit under the IRA. For apprenticeships, specifically, we also suggest requiring contractors to include apprentice identification cards from a registered apprentice program alongside certified payroll records to deter contractors from claiming new or inexperienced workers as qualified apprentices.⁵⁵ Additionally, before a project commences, taxpayers claiming the good faith effort exception for apprenticeship enhancements should be required to file with DOL all records establishing that they requested qualified apprentices from a registered apprenticeship program and were denied or

⁵⁴ The Federal Acquisition Regulation contains such a requirement. *See* FAR 52.222-8(b)(4). The Massachusetts law governing entities engaged in state or local public works projects may also serve as a useful example. *See* Mass. Gen. Laws ch. 149, §27B.

⁵⁵ As an example, *see* Mass. Gen. Laws ch. 149, §§ 27, 27B.

did not receive a timely response. We also urge Treasury and the IRS to require contractors to provide notice to workers on a qualifying project of their right to earn prevailing wages and to provide DOL a signed statement certifying under the penalty of perjury that such notice was provided to obtain a tax credit related to that qualifying project.

Third, Treasury and the IRS also should consider new accountability and enforcement measures specifically designed to ensure wage-related compliance. Importantly, Treasury and the IRS should pursue not only technological measures to identify prevailing wage and apprenticeship violations, but also on-the-ground verification for many types of violations that cannot be readily identified through file reviews. In addition to being filed with DOL, as urged above, all notices of intent to claim a tax credit, statements of compliance, and certified payroll records should be made publicly available and accessible to any interested party—including workers and state and local wage enforcement officers—to enable interested parties to report possible violations. Allowing the public to view disclosures submitted to DOL would not violate tax confidentiality because such information would not be “received by, recorded by, prepared by, furnished to, or collected by the Secretary.” 26 U.S.C. § 6103(b)(2).⁵⁶ We also urge Treasury and the IRS to require entities receiving enhanced credits to comply with related audit and investigation requests by the IRS and federal and state wage authorities and to devote significant resources to prevailing-wage- and apprenticeship-related auditing and enforcement. Treasury and the IRS also should explore ways to enter into agreements with State and local enforcement agencies to collaborate on enforcement of prevailing wage and apprenticeship provisions of the IRA.

Finally, we recommend that Treasury and the IRS design proactive policies and programs to deliver on the IRA’s job-creation promise. For example, Treasury and the IRS should consider collaborating with DOL to access existing funding dedicated to apprenticeship expansion and compliance and incorporating or coordinating with established pre-apprenticeship programs to quickly reach a wider and more diverse group of workers and to incentivize local hires.

ii. Energy Community Recommendations

The State and Local Governments also have relevant experience relating to brownfields that may assist Treasury and the IRS in implementing the energy community credit enhancement in § 45(b)(11)(A). The incorporated definition of a brownfield site (set forth in the Comprehensive Environmental Response,

⁵⁶ See *Lomont v. O’Neill*, 285 F.3d 9, 15 (D.C. Cir. 2002) (holding that disclosure of tax-related information obtained directly from a taxpayer, as opposed to the IRS, does not fall within the definition of “return” or “return information” in § 6103); *Stokwitz v. United States*, 831 F.2d 893, 895-96 (9th Cir. 1987) (“[T]he statutory definitions of ‘return’ and ‘return information’ to which the entire statute relates, confine the statute’s coverage to information that is passed through the IRS.”).

Compensation, and Liability Act of 1980 (CERCLA), 42 U.S.C. § 9601(39)(A), (B), and (D)(ii)(III)) includes “real property, the expansion, redevelopment, or reuse of which may be complicated by the presence or potential presence of a hazardous substance, pollutant, or contaminant.” Treasury and the IRS should require taxpayers claiming eligibility for property as a brownfield to provide documentation substantiating its status as a brownfield within the definition, including information on any brownfield grants received and relevant development and remediation plans.

We also urge Treasury and the IRS to verify claims of brownfield eligibility by collaborating with EPA, which implements CERCLA and maintains an extensive, though not exhaustive, database of known brownfields⁵⁷ and tools to identify sites that have received EPA brownfield grants for assessment or cleanup.⁵⁸ State and Tribal brownfield response programs also often maintain information on brownfields within their jurisdictions.⁵⁹ For example, Massachusetts maintains a Brownfields List identifying brownfields that have received Massachusetts grants.⁶⁰ The District of Columbia’s brownfield program also maintains a map of current and remediated sites with the District.⁶¹

e. Comments on Energy Generation Incentives in IRA § 13202, IRS Notice 2022-49

In Notice 2022-49, the IRS seeks comment on implementing tax credits for energy generation and storage projects. For the purpose of determining eligibility for the clean electricity production credit, Treasury and the IRS should consult with EPA and DOE to promptly publish and timely update the facility greenhouse gas emissions rates in the table of facility emissions rates required to be published annually under § 45Y(b)(2)(C)(i). Additionally, Treasury and the IRS should establish a transparent process for reviewing and responding to petitions to determine the emissions rate for facilities for which an emissions rate has not been established, including procedures for consultation with EPA and DOE on each petition.

Additionally, as Treasury and the IRS consider how to implement energy production tax credits to promote equity and environmental justice, New York’s distributed solar energy program, NY-Sun, provides a good example. NY-Sun includes the Solar Energy Equity Framework (SEEF), which aims to improve access

⁵⁷ EPA, EnviroAtlas, <http://bit.ly/3gd05ld> (last visited Nov. 29, 2022).

⁵⁸ EPA, Cleanups in My Community, <http://bit.ly/3GIJPZL> (last visited Nov. 29, 2022).

⁵⁹ EPA, State and Tribal Brownfields Response Programs, <http://bit.ly/3Xf8mFG> (last visited Nov. 29, 2022).

⁶⁰ Mass. Dep’t of Env’t Prot., Find Brownfields Sites, <http://bit.ly/3tJFfwE> (last visited Nov. 29, 2022).

⁶¹ D.C. Dep’t of Energy & Env’t, Brownfields and DC’s Voluntary Cleanup Program, <https://doee.dc.gov/node/1542566> (last visited Nov. 29, 2022).

to solar electric energy for low- to moderate-income customers, regulated affordable housing, environmental justice communities, and disadvantaged communities.⁶² The SEEF, which has approximately \$400 million in funding, provides technical assistance grants to community groups and local governments, adder incentives for low- and moderate-income residential installations, adder incentives for projects serving affordable housing, and funding for two initiatives based on community solar models.⁶³ As discussed in the comments submitted by the New York State Energy Research and Development Authority (NYSERDA), the authority that administers NY-Sun, Treasury and the IRS should clarify that a community solar project can qualify for the tax credit available for a “qualified low-income economic benefit project” if it is serving a low-income community, regardless of whether it is actually located within that community.⁶⁴

f. Comments on Energy Efficiency Incentives in IRA § 13302 & 13303, IRS Notice 2022-48

Home energy audits are a cornerstone of effective energy efficiency investment. As such, many states with robust and successful energy efficiency programs already cover the cost of home energy efficiency audits. For example, the Mass Save program provides for a free home energy audit, serving as the gateway into the Mass Save residential and small business initiatives.⁶⁵ Similarly, the NYSERDA Residential Energy Assessment Program provides no-cost residential energy audits with subsequent opportunities to make low- or no-cost energy efficiency improvements.⁶⁶ Customers in these jurisdictions are unlikely to seek federal incentives for energy efficiency home audits. But to ensure consistency across jurisdictions and incentivize effective home energy audits nationwide, Treasury and the IRS should require that energy efficiency auditors eligible for IRA credits either be certified with auditor certification programs used in states with existing programs or provide minimum standards based on existing programs. For example, the Building Performance Institute is a national standards development organization for energy efficiency and has provided certification and standards for home performance professionals for over twenty-five years.⁶⁷ Energy Star, too,

⁶² Luke Forster, New York State Energy Research and Development Authority (NYSERDA) Program Updates 12 (Feb. 16, 2022), <https://tinyurl.com/mvp5skyj>.

⁶³ NY-Sun, 2020 – 2030 Operating Plan 5 (May 31, 2022), <https://tinyurl.com/ycxu5dfn>.

⁶⁴ NYSERDA, Comments on U.S. Treasury and IRS Notices 2022-47, 2022-48, 2022-49, and 2022-51, at 6 (Nov. 4, 2022), <https://www.regulations.gov/comment/IRS-2022-0022-0220>.

⁶⁵ See Mass Save, Take an Online Home Energy Assessment, <http://bit.ly/3TMohs4> (last visited Nov. 29, 2022).

⁶⁶ See NYSERDA, Residential Energy Assessment Programs, <http://bit.ly/3UNy56x> (last visited Nov. 29, 2022).

⁶⁷ See Building Performance Inst., Inc., Certified Professionals, <http://bit.ly/3EJ9yKk> (last visited Nov. 29, 2022) (providing certification requirements).

maintains databases of credentialed contractors qualified to perform home energy assessments.⁶⁸

We also recommend that Treasury and the IRS interpret the term “qualified energy property” in § 25C as broadly as possible to defray the costs of upgrades needed to electrify homes across our states. Treasury and the IRS should also permit eligible costs for qualified energy property to be incurred within five years of a panelboard installation or upgrade. Incurring the investment in qualifying energy efficiency improvements, as well as attendant necessary upgrades (e.g., panelboard upgrades), may be cost-prohibitive for many of our State and Local Governments’ disadvantaged and low-wealth residents over a short time period. Allowing a five-year window would alleviate this financial pressure and encourage broader, more equitable energy efficiency investments.

With respect to § 25C’s biomass provisions, we urge Treasury and the IRS to strictly enforce energy efficiency tiers to verify qualification for biomass stoves and boilers. Per British thermal unit (BTU), wood has about the same carbon content as coal,⁶⁹ and, according to EPA, wood contains about 75% more CO₂ per BTU than natural gas.⁷⁰ As a result, wood that is harvested and burned for energy immediately increases greenhouse gas emissions—even where it is displacing fossil fuels.⁷¹ Biomass combustion also emits other harmful air pollutants, like particulate matter, which is connected to a multitude of adverse health consequences including premature death, cardiovascular effects, asthma, bronchitis, pneumonia, chronic obstructive pulmonary disease.⁷² To avoid inadvertently *increasing* greenhouse gas and other harmful pollutant emissions through biomass incentives, Treasury and the IRS should comprehensively evaluate lifecycle greenhouse gas emissions in calculating the efficiency rating of eligible biomass. If, however, Treasury and the IRS elect to rely on EPA wood stove certifications to demonstrate efficiency ratings, they should not allow certification based on test

⁶⁸ See Energy Star, Find Credentialed Contractors, <http://bit.ly/3UJYYZ6> (last visited Nov. 29, 2022).

⁶⁹ See John D. Sterman et al., *Does Replacing Coal with Wood Lower CO₂ Emissions? Dynamic Lifecycle Analysis of Wood Bioenergy*, 13 *Env’t Res. Letters* 1, 2 (2018), <http://bit.ly/3Eaxxk0>.

⁷⁰ U.S. EPA, *Emission Factors for Greenhouse Gas Inventories* (Mar. 26, 2020), <http://bit.ly/3EBVUHV>.

⁷¹ See Sterman, *supra* n.69, at 2 (“Burning wood instead of coal creates a carbon debt—an immediate increase in atmospheric CO₂ compared to fossil energy.”); Philippe Leturcq, *GHG Displacement Factors of Harvested Wood Products: The Myth of Substitution*, 10 *Sci. Rep.* 20752, 4 (Nov. 27, 2020), <http://bit.ly/3X9X6dL> (“The combustion emission of wood is clearly higher than that of other fuels.”); Mary S. Booth, *Not Carbon Neutral: Assessing the Net Emissions Impact of Residues Burned for Bioenergy*, 13 *Env’t Res. Letters* 035001, 1 (Feb. 21, 2018), <http://bit.ly/3EciyGq> (“Biomass power plants tend to emit more CO₂ than fossil fueled plants per MWh, and as shown by a number of studies, net emissions from bioenergy can exceed emissions from fossil fuels for decades.”).

⁷² See U.S. Glob. Change Rsch. Prog., *Impacts, Risks, and Adaptation in the United States: Fourth National Climate Assessment, Volume II*, at 517-19 (2018, rev. 2020), <https://tinyurl.com/2p9amj8d>; Luke P. Naeher et al., *Woodsmoke Health Effects: A Review*, 19 *Inhalation Toxicology* 1, 67 (2007).

methods 125 and 127 (relying on ASTM 3053), which allow too much variability and manufacturer and laboratory manipulation.⁷³

Finally, we recommend defining “substantial reconstruction and rehabilitation” for purposes of the new energy efficient home credit in § 45L to include any existing building that can achieve Energy Star or Zero Energy Ready Homes certification. Utilizing a broader definition will signal the importance of developing a housing stock that is energy efficient and aligned with our state climate objectives.

g. Comments on Energy Security Tax Credits for Manufacturing in IRA § 50265, IRS Notice 2022-47

In implementing the § 45X advanced manufacturing production credit, Treasury and the IRS should develop guidance and regulations, in consultation with EPA on an expedited basis, that seeks to prevent the realization of tax benefits by producers that have a history of environmental noncompliance, particularly in disadvantaged and low wealth communities. Additionally, for purposes of determining eligibility for the qualifying advanced energy credit under § 45C, the Secretary of Treasury is directed to identify projects designed to produce “other advanced energy property designed to reduce greenhouse gas emissions as may be determined by the Secretary” and projects retrofitted with “other technology designed to reduce greenhouse gas emissions, as determined by the Secretary.” Treasury should develop detailed guidance and regulations explaining how the Secretary will identify property and technology “designed to reduce greenhouse gas emissions” and providing for consultation with EPA and DOE in such processes.

h. Comments on Credits for Clean Vehicles in IRA § 13401, IRS Notice 2022-46

The State and Local Governments appreciate Treasury and the IRS’s commitment to prompt implementation of the IRA’s clean vehicles credits, including its early guidance on the IRA’s new final assembly requirement.⁷⁴ It is critical that electric vehicle incentives get into the hands of consumers now to make electric vehicles more affordable and reduce transportation-related emissions of greenhouse gases and other harmful pollutants along transportation corridors. The State and Local Governments recognize, however, that the IRA’s clean vehicles provisions raise numerous complex, technical issues that may not be able to be resolved immediately, including, for example, supply chain tracking for § 30D(e)’s sourcing

⁷³ See Northeast States for Coordinated Air Use Mgmt., Assessment of EPA’s Residential Wood Heater Certification Program (2021), <http://bit.ly/3gfTOFi>.

⁷⁴ Press Release, U.S. Dep’t of the Treasury, Treasury Releases Initial Information on Electric Vehicle Tax Credit Under Newly Enacted Inflation Reduction Act (Aug. 16, 2022), <https://home.treasury.gov/news/press-releases/jy0923>.

and manufacturing requirements. Accordingly, we urge Treasury and the IRS to quickly issue transitional guidance making clean vehicle credits widely available, with clear step-by-step instructions for car buyers and dealers to follow. But Treasury and the IRS must also commit to a schedule for further stakeholder engagement, *see supra* Section II, and updated guidance implementing these provisions on an ongoing basis.

IV. Conclusion

We appreciate the opportunity to provide these recommendations to ensure effective and equitable implementation of the IRA.

Respectfully submitted,

FOR THE COMMONWEALTH OF
MASSACHUSETTS

MAURA HEALEY
Attorney General

TURNER SMITH
Deputy Chief & Assistant Attorney General

JULIA JONAS-DAY

I. ANDREW GOLDBERG

Assistant Attorneys General

Environmental Protection Division

JO ANN BODEMER

Assistant Attorney General

KELLY CAIAZZO

Special Assistant Attorney General

Energy & Telecommunications Division

BARBARA DILLON DESOUZA

Assistant Attorney General

Fair Labor Division

Office of the Attorney General

One Ashburton Place, 18th Fl.

Boston, MA 02108

(617) 727-2200

Turner.Smith@mass.gov

FOR THE STATE OF COLORADO

PHILIP J. WEISER
Attorney General

SCOTT STEINBRECHER
Assistant Deputy Attorney General
Natural Resources & Environment Section
Ralph C. Carr Colorado Judicial Center
1300 Broadway, 7th Floor
Denver, Colorado 80203
(720) 508-6287
Scott.Steinbrecher@coag.gov

FOR THE STATE OF DELAWARE

KATHLEEN JENNINGS
Attorney General

CHRISTIAN DOUGLAS WRIGHT
Director of Impact Litigation
VANESSA L. KASSAB
Deputy Attorney General
Delaware Department of Justice
820 N. French Street
Wilmington, DE 19801

FOR THE STATE OF ILLINOIS

KWAME RAOUL
Attorney General

MATTHEW J. DUNN
Chief, Environmental Enforcement/
Asbestos Litigation Division
JASON E. JAMES
Assistant Attorney General
Office of the Attorney General
201 West Pointe Drive, Suite 7
Belleville, IL 62226
(872) 276-3583
jason.james@ilag.gov

FOR THE STATE OF MAINE

AARON M. FREY
Attorney General

EMMA AKRAWI
Assistant Attorney General
Natural Resources Division
6 State House Station
Augusta, ME 04333-0006
(207) 626-8800

FOR THE STATE OF MARYLAND

BRIAN E. FROSH
Attorney General

STEVEN J. GOLDSTEIN
Special Assistant Attorney General
200 St. Paul Place
Baltimore, MD 21202
sgoldstein@oag.state.md.us
(410) 576-6414

FOR THE PEOPLE OF THE STATE OF
MICHIGAN

DANA NESSEL
Attorney General

ELIZABETH MORRISSEAU
Assistant Attorney General
Environment, Natural Resources, and
Agriculture Division
6th Floor G. Mennen Williams Building
525 W. Ottawa Street
P.O. Box 30755
Lansing, MI 48909
(517) 335-7664
MorrissetteE@michigan.gov

FOR THE STATE OF NEW JERSEY

MATTHEW J. PLATKIN
Attorney General

MATTHEW NOVAK
Deputy Attorney General
Division of Law
25 Market Street
P.O. Box 093
Trenton, NJ 08625-093
(609) 376-2745
Matthew.novak@law.njoag.gov

FOR THE STATE OF NEW YORK

LETITIA JAMES
Attorney General

MICHAEL J. MYERS
Senior Counsel for Air Pollution and Climate
Change Litigation
Environmental Protection Bureau
Office of the Attorney General
The Capitol
Albany, NY 12224
(518) 776-2382
michael.myers@ag.ny.gov

FOR THE STATE OF OREGON

ELLEN F. ROSENBLUM
Attorney General

PAUL A. GARRAHAN
Attorney-in-Charge
STEVE NOVICK
Special Assistant Attorney General
Natural Resources Section
Oregon Department of Justice
1162 Court Street NE
Salem, OR 97301
(503) 947-4540
Paul.Garrahan@doj.state.or.us
Steve.Novick@doj.state.or.us

FOR THE STATE OF RHODE ISLAND

PETER F. NERONHA
Attorney General

ALISON B. HOFFMAN
Special Assistant Attorney General
Chief, Environment and Energy Unit
Rhode Island Office of the Attorney General
150 South Main Street
Providence, RI 02903
(401) 274-4400 ext. 2116
ahoffman@riag.ri.gov

FOR THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA

KARL A. RACINE
Attorney General

LAUREN CULLUM
Special Assistant Attorney General
Office of the Attorney General for the
District of Columbia
400 6th St. NW
Washington, DC 20001
(202) 727-3400
lauren.cullum@dc.gov

FOR THE CALIFORNIA AIR
RESOURCES BOARD

THEODORE MCCOMBS
Deputy Attorney General
California Department of Justice
600 W. Broadway, Suite 1800
San Diego, CA 92103
(619) 738-9003
theodore.mccombs@doj.ca.gov

FOR THE OFFICE OF THE RAMSEY
COUNTY ATTORNEY

JOHN CHOI
Ramsey County Attorney

TOM MADISON
Assistant County Attorney
Office of the Ramsey County Attorney
Lowry Building, Suite 120
345 Wabasha Street North
Saint Paul, MN 55102
(651) 266-3222